

**Academic Affairs  
DRAFT as of 4/10/13**

**This procedure needs further review by Chancellor's Council**

**AP 4021 PROGRAM REVITALIZATION/DISCONTINUANCE**

**References:**

Education Code Section 78016;  
Title 5 Sections 51022 and 55130

***NOTE: A procedure for discontinuance of career and technical education is legally required. Procedures for discontinuance of other programs are suggested as good practice. Insert local practice.***

The procedure for discontinuance of career and technical education programs should include a:

- process for reviewing such programs every two years to ensure they meet legal standards.
  - process for termination of program by the Board of Trustees if legal and other District standards are not met.
- ❖ **From current CLPCCD Administrative Rules and Procedures 6200 titled Program Revitalization/Discontinuance Process**

**Purpose:**

~~In conformance with Title 5 (CCR sect. # 51022) as well as generally accepted institutional good practice, the purpose of the process described here is to conduct an assessment of programs that have been identified by the Vice President of Academic Services or the Vice President of Student Services (whichever is appropriate) as needing to be revitalized or potentially discontinued. Each college recognizes that our curriculum and course offerings must be responsive to the needs of the students and the community, and further that they must support the mission of the college and the goals of individual programs as these are identified in the official planning documents of the college (recent program review, unit plan, college educational master plan, strategic plan, etc.). As the needs of the students and community changes, the content and make-up of the educational programs must undergo regular review for appropriateness and effectiveness including both qualitative and quantitative measures. For instructional programs, the definition of program is that set forth in CCR Title 5, Section 55000: "An organized sequence of~~

courses leading to a defined objective, a degree, a certificate, a diploma, a license, or transfer to another institution of higher education.”

**NOTE:** The following language shown as struck and shaded in gray is reflected in the appendix of AP 4020 titled Program and Curriculum Development

**Qualitative and Quantitative Measures:**

When possible the following measures will be described in terms of three-year trends and will be compared to district and regional and/or similar-type programs. These measures are the triggers that can begin this process. In cases where previous work has already been done to address program weaknesses, the initiating Vice President should refer to that work in the notifying communications (see “Previous work” in list below, and also “Identification and Notification” section, below).

**Qualitative Measures:**

Consistent with mission and values of the college

Student satisfaction

Employer satisfaction

Previous work to enhance program’s effectiveness, as indicated by faculty in program, in Enrollment Management Discipline Plans, program reviews, or other initiatives.

Advisory committee work and recommendations

Balance of curriculum across college

Transfer program availability

Marketing and outreach efforts

Constraints that may affect enrollments, completion, persistence

Regional demand for the program

Impact of program on students, including underrepresented and/or at-risk students

Impact of program on the changing composition and diversity of the community

Impact of program on other programs

Currency and articulation of curriculum

Appropriateness of curriculum in relation to industry standards and/or employer expectations

Outside accreditation issues (ACCJC/WASC and other external accrediting bodies)

Transfer outcomes

**Quantitative Measures:**

Employability of graduates, job availability and placement

Wage data

Regional demand for the program, as indicated by Labor Market Information data available from EDD and other comparable data sources

Analysis based on market and academic trends

Similar programs in district and region, with ‘region’ defined as appropriate to the target population and/or need for the skills and certification provided by the program

Retention within courses

Persistence across courses within major or certificate  
Number of students using program to achieve educational goal  
Rate of student achievement of program goals  
Completers of program  
Course offerings and schedule sufficient for reasonable program completion  
Enrollments in terms of fill-rates and WSCH/FTEF  
Non-instructional cost per FTES (e.g., facilities, equipment, materials, staffing)  
Number of transfers or transfer-ready students

## **Course cancellation patterns**

### **Timeline:**

Overall, this process will take up to two years with a possibility, determined by the Vice President of Academic Services or the Vice President of Student Services, of extending it for one more year. It can be shortened upon request of the personnel in the program. Upon the consent of all of the members of the ad hoc committee, the process may continue over the summer. At any point the committee or the program personnel can request a meeting or submit documents outside of the schedule outlined below. Program personnel, in consultation with the area dean and Vice President, can choose at any time during this process to suspend the program and the services and course offerings attached to the program. Suspension does not mean cancellation.

The Chancellor may, as the designee of the Board of Trustees, initiate the steps of this process while setting aside the timeline due to urgent budget constraints. The Chancellor will inform the Board of Trustees of this action. The broad fiscal implications of possible program discontinuance must be addressed. This suspension of the timeline will be made clear to program personnel, supervising administrator and others involved in the process upon notification.

### **First Semester (Notification; Monitoring/Analysis):**

Prior to 1st day of classes—Notification to program personnel and area dean (or supervising administrator, if not a dean). The Vice President initiating the process will, whenever possible, make this notification before the end of the previous semester.

Week 3—Meeting between Vice President and program personnel and area dean; Vice President will provide documentation relevant to Program Revitalization/Discontinuance process; and the ad hoc committee (\*see [page 6 below](#)) will be formed.

Week 5—Meeting between Vice President and ad hoc committee.

Week 9—Program personnel, including area dean(1), submit initial response to ad hoc committee.

<sup>(1)</sup> Henceforth in the document, “program personnel” may be taken to include participation of area dean or supervising administrator, as appropriate.

---

Week 11—Ad hoc committee meets with program personnel and program personnel submit data and narrative analysis of data and all relevant qualitative and quantitative measures in preparation for submittal of the Plan of Action, below.

### **Second Semester (Monitoring and Responding)**

Week 2—Program personnel submit a Plan of Action to ad hoc committee.

Week 3—Ad hoc committee responds to plan.

Week 4—Vice President and faculty member of ad hoc committee meet with program personnel regarding resource requests, if necessary.

Week 15—Ad hoc committee meets with program personnel to go over information regarding written report on progress program is making on implementation of plan and initial indications of achievement of stated goals.

Week 17—Ad hoc committee submits progress report to program personnel and Vice President.

### **Third Semester (Implementation and Progress Status, Recommendation)**

Week 10—Ad hoc committee meets with program personnel to go over information regarding written report on progress program is making on implementation of plan and indications of achievement of stated goals.

Week 12—Ad hoc committee submits progress report with provisional recommendation in a meeting with program personnel, and ad hoc committee shares recommendations in a joint meeting of the college Academic Senate and the college’s planning council (IPBC for Chabot, College Council for LPC). At this meeting there will be time for public comments and input.

Week 14—Program personnel respond to progress report and provisional ad hoc committee recommendation, if deemed necessary by program personnel.

Week 17—Ad hoc committee recommends (to the Vice President) extension, discontinuance or acceptance with rationale and implications/impacts of decision, and committee shares recommendation at an Academic Senate meeting.

### **Fourth Semester (Course of Action)**

By Week Three —Vice President makes recommendation to the College President regarding program, and meets with program personnel to discuss implications for

students, staff, faculty affected by the recommended course of action. In making this recommendation, the Vice President must give substantial weight to the recommendation of the ad hoc committee.

By Week Five – If program discontinuance is the Vice President's recommendation, and if the President concurs, the President will make the necessary recommendation to the Chancellor for Board of Trustees action. In making this recommendation, the President must give substantial weight to the recommendation of the ad hoc committee. If a recommendation is made for discontinuance, and the recommendation is accepted by the Chancellor and the Board, reasonable efforts will be made to provide opportunities for students to finish the program or transfer to a related program.

### **Identification and Notification**

Only the Vice President of Academic Services or Vice President of Student Services (whichever is appropriate) can identify a program as needing to go through this process.

The Vice President will notify the faculty and staff working in the program, as well as the dean in the area, and will meet with all of the employees working in the program or at least representatives from each area—administration, faculty, staff, and students(2)—within two work weeks of notification. The Vice President must employ at least three appropriate quantitative and qualitative measures identified in this packet, including the analysis of the College Enrollment Management Committee. In cases where previous work has already been done to address program weaknesses, the initiating Vice President should refer to that work in the notifying communications. The Vice President will notify the program prior to the first day of classes in the academic year in which the Program Discontinuance/Revitalization process is to begin. However, in the event that the district Chancellor has suspended the timeline for this process due to a recognized fiscal crisis, the initiating Vice President will include this fact, and the urgent budget constraints that have given rise to the suspension, in his/her notification communications.

At the meeting the Vice President will present the relevant qualitative and quantitative data from the list above and a brief narrative explaining the reasons for identifying the program as needing to go through this process. The Vice President will also present and go over the process described below. The program personnel will be given the opportunity to write an initial response to be submitted to the ad hoc committee within four weeks of the meeting with the Vice President. The report may include updated data and other relevant data; contextualization; past, current and future actions aimed at improving the effectiveness of the program vis-à-vis the students; and any other relevant information. A record will be made that this meeting occurred, who attended, and what documents were shared. This record will be made available to the ad hoc committee.

---

(2) Student representatives will be included for programs where there is a clear and consistent constituency of affected students who can be identified and approached to provide representation (e.g., occupational certificate/degree programs, etc.). Otherwise, the associated student body president for the college will be invited to attend or send a representative.

### **The \*Ad Hoc Committee Composition:**

The committee should include members who have relevant expertise. It will consist of two administrators—Vice President or designee and a dean appointed by the Vice President; three faculty members— two appointed by the Academic Senate (one of which is not from the program targeted and if possible is from the Enrollment Management Committee, and one of which may be from the program targeted, if possible) and one not in the program appointed by the Faculty Association; an expert in the program's subject matter (whenever possible) as mutually agreed upon by the Academic Senate and the Vice President; and one classified staff appointed jointly by the Classified Senate and classified union. (Classified staff will only be appointed when classified personnel work directly within the program in question.)

### **The Ad Hoc Committee's Initial Work:**

Within three weeks of notification of program personnel, the Vice President will convene an ad hoc committee to participate in the process. The Vice President will meet with the committee and present the same documents presented to the affected group described under Identification and Notification above. The Vice President will also go over the process and the expectations of the committee.

The committee will be given five work weeks to inquire about and formulate an understanding of the status of the program in question. The committee will be required to collect and address as many of the qualitative and quantitative measures listed above as is reasonably attainable. They will be charged with interpreting those measures and indicating where salient measures are not available to them. The committee will also consider and incorporate into their narrative any input submitted to them by the personnel in the program. At the end of the five work weeks the committee will meet with the program personnel and present the data and their understanding of those measures in the form of a written analysis. The committee is encouraged to offer suggestions and feedback at this time as to how the program could improve its effectiveness. (Some "Possible Actions" are described in the addendum to this packet.)

The committee will continue to engage and support the activities of the program personnel in this process upon request of those same personnel.

### **Program Personnel's Initial Work:**

After meeting with the committee and receiving their narrative report and data measures, the program personnel will be charged with creating a Plan of Action to improve the program's effectiveness in the areas indicated by the Vice President and the committee and any other areas the program considers relevant. The Plan of Action must be submitted to the committee no later than the end of the second week

of the second semester in the academic year in which the program was notified that it was to take part in this process. The Plan of Action must include: 1) a clear description of each action that will take place; 2) a timeframe during which that action will take place; and 3) a method and process by which the usefulness of the action will be measured. The Plan of Action may also include any resources the program needs to aid in improving the program's effectiveness. (Some "Possible Actions" are described in the addendum to this packet.) While the college is not obligated to make these resources available simply upon request, it will, through the direction of the committee and the Vice President, make every effort to provide resources where clearly needed and when possible. If a positive response to the request is not feasible, the Vice President will communicate this in a direct meeting with the program personnel and one faculty member of the committee. A record of this meeting will be made available to the whole committee. In the event that the resources requested by the program are not made available, this will not be grounds for the program to not participate in the process.

#### **Second and Third Semester Work:**

1) The program personnel will conduct the work and activities described in the Plan of Action during these terms. The Plan of Action can be amended or revised at any time during this time period by mutual consent of the Vice President and the program personnel. The program will be required to submit documentation (evidence) of these activities, including the assessment of the activities, by the end of the fourteenth week of the second semester and by the end of the tenth week of the third semester. The ad hoc committee will meet with the program personnel by the end of the week indicated in the timeline above and will discuss information and analysis going into the progress report. The progress report will be submitted to the program personnel and the Vice President by the end of the week indicated in the timeline above.

#### **Fourth Semester:**

If the Vice President determines that the process should be extended by one year then the program will be required to submit an "Extended Plan of Action" with the same elements as the original by the end of Week 7. In such a case, the rest of the timeline of this semester will be the same as indicated in the Second Semester. Further, the timeline in the Fifth and Sixth semester will be the same as indicated in the Third and Fourth Semester, respectively.

The Vice President will make a recommendation on program status to the College President. In making this recommendation, the Vice President must give substantial weight to the recommendation of the ad hoc committee. He/she will meet with program personnel to discuss implications for students, staff, and faculty affected by the recommended course of action. The written recommendation will be shared with the Academic Senate and Classified Senate. As appropriate, the College President will recommend to the Chancellor and the Board of Trustees if a program is to be discontinued. In making this recommendation, the President must give substantial weight to the recommendation of the ad hoc committee. If a recommendation is

made for discontinuance, and the recommendation is accepted by the Chancellor and the Board, reasonable efforts will be made to provide opportunities for students to finish the program or transfer to a related program.

**Possible Actions/Outcomes:**

Program develops plan for recruitment of targeted populations  
Program initiates cooperative ventures with local employers, transfer institutions, and/or other community colleges  
Enhanced career and/or academic counseling services  
Adjustment of course scheduling  
Analysis of demand for the program through use of labor market information and concerted work with advisory boards  
Articulation of programs with K-12 and/or four year and/or technical institutions  
Faculty development in classroom techniques, methodology, best practices  
Analysis of the curriculum to look at how learning is used in other courses within program and beyond program  
Enhanced Student support services: tutoring, learning skills, childcare, financial aid  
Analysis of program resources in terms of faculty (including full-time to part-time ratio), facilities, equipment, materials, supplies, software  
Analysis of integration with college resources such as instructional technology, library, counseling, tutoring Design, implementation, and assessment of focused learning outcomes where students seem to be having problems Consolidation of Chabot and LPC programs

Collective Bargaining Issues  
FSAs  
Retraining  
Notification  
Faculty workload

---

**NOTE:** The **red ink** signifies language that is **legally required** (for career/technical programs) and recommended by the Policy and Procedure Service and its legal counsel. The language in **black ink** is from current CLPCCD Administrative Rules and Procedures 6200 titled Program Revitalization/Discontinuance Process issued on April 18, 2006. The language in **blue ink** is included for consideration. The **green ink** was added during the administrative review on March 21, 2013. This document was reviewed on April 8, 2013 by Chancellor's Cabinet and on April 9, 2013 by the Chancellor's Council. This document was reviewed by representatives of the Academic Senates on December 12, 2013.

---

**Date Approved:**

*(This new procedure replaces current Administrative Rules and Procedure 6200)*



# Legal Citations for AP 4021

## Education Code Section 78016; Title 5 Sections 51022 and 55130

### Education Code Section 78016

**78016.** (a) Every vocational or occupational training program offered by a community college district shall be reviewed every two years by the governing board of the district to ensure that each program, as demonstrated by the California Occupational Information System, including the State-Local Cooperative Labor Market Information Program established in Section 10533 of the Unemployment Insurance **Code**, or if this program is not available in the labor market area, other available sources of labor market information, does all of the following:

(1) Meets a documented labor market demand.

(2) Does not represent unnecessary duplication of other manpower training programs in the area.

(3) Is of demonstrated effectiveness as measured by the employment and completion success of its students.

(b) Any program that does not meet the requirements of subdivision (a) and the standards promulgated by the governing board shall be terminated within one year.

(c) The review process required by this section shall include the review and comments by the local Private Industry Council established pursuant to Division 8 (commencing with Section 15000) of the Unemployment Insurance **Code**, which review and comments shall occur prior to any decision by the appropriate governing body.

(d) This section shall apply to each program commenced subsequent to July 28, 1983.

(e) A written summary of the findings of each review shall be made available to the public.

5 CCR s 51022

Cal. Admin. Code tit. 5, s 51022

### TITLE 5. EDUCATION DIVISION 6. CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES CHAPTER 2. COMMUNITY COLLEGE STANDARDS SUBCHAPTER 1. MINIMUM CONDITIONS

s 51022. Instructional Programs.

(a) Within six months of the formation of a community college district, the governing board shall adopt and carry out its policies for the establishment, modification, or discontinuance of courses or programs. Such policies shall incorporate statutory responsibilities regarding vocational or occupational training program review as specified in section 78016 of the Education Code.

(b) Within six months of the formation of a community college district, the governing board shall adopt and carry out its policies and procedures to provide that its courses and programs are articulated with proximate baccalaureate colleges and high schools.

5 CCR s 55130  
Cal. Admin. Code tit. 5, s 55130

TITLE 5. EDUCATION  
DIVISION 6. CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES  
CHAPTER 6. CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION  
SUBCHAPTER 2. APPROVAL BY THE CHANCELLOR  
ARTICLE 1. APPROVAL OF CREDIT EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS  
s 55130. Approval of Credit Programs.

(a) Before offering any credit course as part of an educational program at a college, the governing board of a district shall obtain approval of the educational program from the Chancellor in accordance with the provisions of this article. Approval shall be requested on forms provided by the Chancellor.

(b) The application for approval shall contain at least the following:

- (1) The name of the proposed program.
- (2) The description of the proposed program.
- (3) a list of required courses to be included in the program.
- (4) course outlines of records for all courses in the program.
- (5) The purposes and specific objectives of the proposed program.
- (6) The place of the proposed program in the district master plan.
- (7) An explanation of how the program is appropriate to the objectives and conditions of higher education and community college education in California and how it conforms to statewide master planning.
- (8) The need for the proposed program ascertained with regard to at least the following factors:
  - (A) Other community colleges in the area currently offering the program;

(B) Other programs closely related to the proposed program offered by the college;

(C) Relation of the proposed program to job market analysis, where applicable;

(D) Enrollment projection for the proposed program;

(E) Recommendations of career technical education regional consortia, when applicable;  
and

(F) The classification of the courses in the program in accordance with section 55001.

(9) The need for and present adequacy of the following resources shall be determined in relation to the proposed program:

(A) Library and media center resources;

(B) Facilities and equipment required to initiate and sustain the program. If a new facility is to be used, reference should be made to the five-year master plan.

(C) Availability of adequate or proposed financial support; and

(D) Availability of faculty.

(c) The development, establishment and evaluation of an education program shall include representative faculty involvement.

(d) An approval is effective until the program or implementation of the program is discontinued or modified in any substantial way. The Chancellor may evaluate an educational program, after its approval, on the basis of factors listed in this section. If on the basis of such an evaluation the Chancellor determines that an educational program should no longer be offered, the Chancellor may terminate the approval and determine the effective date of termination.

(e) In multi college districts, program approval is granted for a specific college.